

THE MALAY DILEMMA. Oleh: Mahathir Mohamad. Penerbit: D. Moore for Asia Pacific Press. 1970. Halaman 188. ISBN 978-981-204-355-9.

"The Malay Dilemma," written by Mahathir Mohamad in 1970, stands as a significant and controversial piece in the landscape of Malaysian political thought. Authored by a future Prime Minister of Malaysia, the book delves into the economic and social disparities faced by the Malay community, advocating for policies to address these imbalances. It serves as both a historical document and a foundational text influencing Malaysia's socio-economic policies. This review aims to dissect the themes, arguments, and impact of the book while considering its broader implications in Malaysian history.

The book opens with a historical analysis of Malaysia, focusing on the colonial period's impact on the socio-economic fabric of the nation. Mahathir argues that British colonial policies disproportionately benefited the non-Malay communities—primarily the Chinese and Indians—at the expense of the Malays. He suggests that this legacy created deep-rooted economic and social disparities, which persisted into post-independence Malaysia. Mahathir provides a detailed examination of economic disparities between the Malays and non-Malays. He highlights the Malays' predominance in agriculture and other low-income sectors compared to the Chinese and Indian communities, who have historically dominated commerce and industry. This economic divide, Mahathir argues, has resulted in a cycle of poverty and underdevelopment among the Malays. The book includes statistical data and case studies to substantiate its claims, portraying a grim picture of the economic challenges faced by Malays. Mahathir's analysis covers various aspects such as income levels, employment opportunities, and educational attainment, illustrating how these factors contribute to the overall economic gap.

Mahathir extends his analysis to the social and political consequences of these economic disparities. He contends that the economic imbalances could lead to social unrest and political instability if not addressed. The book discusses the potential for ethnic tensions and conflicts arising from these disparities, emphasizing the need for policies that promote national cohesion and stability. In the latter part of the book, Mahathir proposes a range of solutions to address the Malay dilemma. Central to his proposals is the idea of affirmative action, which includes measures such as preferential treatment in education, employment, and business opportunities for Malays. He argues that such policies are necessary to level the playing field and promote socio-economic equity. Mahathir's proposals laid the groundwork for the New Economic Policy (NEP) implemented in 1971, which aimed to correct economic imbalances and enhance the economic position of Malays and other bumiputera (indigenous) groups. The NEP was a direct manifestation of the ideas discussed in "The Malay Dilemma."

One of the central themes of "The Malay Dilemma" is the impact of colonial policies on economic inequality. Mahathir's critique of the British colonial administration underscores how its policies favored non-Malay communities, exacerbating economic disparities. He argues that the colonial strategy of dividing the population along ethnic lines for administrative convenience led to unequal economic development. While Mahathir's analysis is rooted in historical context, it has been critiqued for its reliance on ethnic-based explanations for economic inequality. Critics argue that

this perspective may oversimplify complex socio-economic issues, such as regional development disparities and varying levels of educational attainment, which also contribute to economic outcomes.

Mahathir's advocacy for affirmative action is perhaps the most contentious aspect of the book. He proposes a series of measures designed to uplift the economic status of Malays, including quotas for educational institutions, preferential treatment in government contracts, and support for Malay-owned businesses. The New Economic Policy (NEP), which was influenced by Mahathir's recommendations, aimed to reduce poverty and restructure societal imbalances. The NEP succeeded in elevating the economic status of many Malays, but it also faced criticism for perpetuating ethnic-based policies that could foster divisions and inefficiencies. Critics argue that while affirmative action can address immediate disparities, it may also create new forms of inequality and dependency. The emphasis on ethnicity rather than need-based assistance has led to issues of corruption and mismanagement, as well as unintended socio-economic consequences. Mahathir's concerns about social cohesion and political stability are evident throughout the book. He warns that unaddressed economic disparities could lead to ethnic tensions and social unrest. His proposals for affirmative action are thus framed as not only a means of economic redress but also as a strategy for maintaining national stability.

While Mahathir's concerns were prescient, the implementation of affirmative action policies has had mixed results. The NEP's focus on ethnic quotas has sometimes led to increased ethnic polarization and a lack of focus on merit-based outcomes. The book's emphasis on ethnic-based solutions raises important questions about balancing equity and unity in a multi-ethnic society. "The Malay Dilemma" has been both influential and controversial. While it provides valuable insights into the socio-economic challenges faced by Malays, it also presents a narrow perspective that prioritizes ethnic-based explanations for economic disparities. Critics argue that this approach may reinforce ethnic divisions rather than fostering a more integrated national identity. The book's focus on ethnic-based affirmative action policies has been criticized for creating new forms of inequality and dependency. The NEP, while successful in improving the economic status of many Malays, has faced issues related to inefficiency, corruption, and social polarization.

Moreover, Mahathir's analysis does not fully address other factors contributing to economic disparities, such as differences in educational attainment and regional development. By focusing predominantly on ethnic lines, the book may overlook these broader socio-economic factors that also play a role in shaping economic outcomes. "The Malay Dilemma" has had a profound impact on Malaysian politics and policy-making. The ideas presented in the book influenced the formulation of policies aimed at addressing economic imbalances and promoting national unity. The NEP, which emerged from the book's recommendations, represents a significant attempt to rectify socio-economic disparities and promote socio-political stability.

However, the long-term impact of these policies remains a subject of debate. While the NEP succeeded in improving the economic status of many Malays, it also faced criticism for its approach and outcomes. The policies have led to ongoing discussions about the balance between ethnic-based affirmative action and merit-based systems, as well as the broader implications for national unity and development. "The Malay Dilemma" remains a seminal work in understanding

Malaysia's socio-political landscape. Mahathir Mohamad's insights into the economic and social challenges faced by the Malay community provide a foundational understanding of the issues and the policies designed to address them.

The book's influence on Malaysian policy, particularly through the New Economic Policy, underscores its significance in shaping the nation's socio-economic trajectory. However, its ethnic-centric approach and the subsequent impact of the NEP invite critical examination and ongoing debate. As Malaysia continues to evolve, the dialogue initiated by Mahathir's book remains relevant in addressing the complexities of ethnic relations and economic inequality. While "The Malay Dilemma" offers valuable perspectives, it also serves as a reminder of the challenges and trade-offs involved in crafting policies aimed at achieving socio-economic equity and national cohesion.

Luqman Mahmud

Pusat Pengajian Pengurusan Perniagaan

Universiti Utara Malaysia